



LHTAC STAFF REPORT

Council Meeting

March 13, 2019

Agenda Item: Federal-aid Rural Application Revised Rankings

Presenter: Scott Ellsworth, P.E.

Overview

Federal-aid rural applications were presented and approved at the Council Meeting on Thursday March 7, 2019.

After the item was presented at the Council Meeting, a comment was received that the scoring seemed to be incorrect. In preparation of this meeting, we reviewed all of our numbers, scores and rankings again to ensure that all numbers are correct.

On application R23, Oakley Highway District, Scorer #5 showed an 11. After reviewing the spreadsheet, the 11 should have been a total score of 63. This changes the total score of the application moving it from 23rd place to 5th place.

Application R11, East Side Highway District, the cost penalty was not taken into account. The project construction cost is stated to be \$2,876,216. Our application program states for each \$200,000 requested over the \$2,000,000, one point will be deducted from the applicant's total score per scorer. The \$800,000 over \$2M is 4 points per scorer deducted from the total score. The total score of 306 minus the 20 points changes the score to 286. This moves this application from 13th to 21st.

Another item noticed was the R5, City of Challis, which was showing a project cost of \$14,304,000. Since the program identifies construction costs to be \$2,000,000, the total project cost was incorrect. We tabulated their project cost sheet and determined that the correct project cost number is \$1,788,000. This cost number is not used in the scoring of the application and the application did not move in the rankings.

Recommendation: For Council review and approval of corrected changes and rankings

2019 Rural Applications Original Presented at Council Meeting 3-7-19

Ref. No.	Local Sponsor	Project Title	Total Cost	Route	Scorer #1	Scorer #2	Scorer #3	Scorer #4	Scorer #5	Total Score				
R22	Raft River Highway District	Old Highway 81 S Road Rehabilitation, Stage 2	\$2,043,000.00	STC-2847□	67	68	68	67	65	335	1			
R10	Post Falls Highway District	Hayden Ave & Meyer Rd Intersection Improvements	\$1,908,000.00	STC-5734 STC-5791	65	67	65	66	66	329	2			
R2	Wendell Highway District	Bob Barton; 2200E-2400E	\$2,819,998.00	STC-2765□	67	61	66	65	63	322	3			
R13	Mountain Home Highway District	STC-3811, Pine-Fetherville Road Rehabilitation Project	\$2,004,000.00	STC-3811□	67	63	65	65	62	322	4			
R26	Filer Highway District	3700 N Road; 2100 E to 2300 E	\$2,378,000.00	STC-2713□	65	63	63	64	63	318	5			
R17	Glenns Ferry Highway District	Old Highway 30; Hammett to Billy Rio Loop Rd STC-3816	\$2,000,000.00	STC-3816□	62	62	62	65	65	316	6			
R21	Murtaugh Highway District	1500W Road Rehabilitation Project; 1000S to 800S	\$2,008,000.00	STC-2742□	62	65	64	63	62	316	7			
R25	Hillsdale Highway District	Crestview Road RehabilitationPhase II	\$2,423,000.00	STC-2793□	66	61	63	64	61	315	8			
R18	Oneida County	Old Highway 37, Phase III	\$2,000,000.00	STC-1701□	65	61	59	64	64	313	9			
R12	Worley Highway District	Rockford Bay Road, Ph 1 Improvements	\$2,001,987.94	STC-5749□	62	64	62	62	58	308	10			
R14	Bonner County	Garfield Bay Rd Reconstruction	\$1,097,037.00	STC-5774□	62	61	63	62	60	308	11			
R3	Burley Highway District	Yale Road Stage 5	\$2,306,000.00	STC-2837□	62	60	62	61	62	307	12			
R11	East Side Highway District	E Sunnyside Road Improvements	\$3,420,953.84	STC-5746	61	63	61	62	59	306	13	Construction cost over \$2M		
R28	Hagerman Highway District	Hagerman Highway; 1200 E to 1400 E	\$2,374,000.00	STC-2775□	62	60	61	62	60	305	14			
R6	City of McCall	E Deinhard Lane Improvement Project	\$1,624,000.00	STC-3907□	63	59	60	63	59	304	15			
R27	West Point Highway District	1500 E Road; 3200 S to 3400 S	\$2,378,000.00	STC-2711□	62	60	59	61	60	302	16			
R16	Notus Parma Highway District #2	Galloway Road; Stafford to I-84	\$1,571,000.00	STC-3780□	60	57	59	59	57	292	17			
R4	Teton County	S5000W Reconstruction	\$1,999,000.00	STC-6820□	59	56	59	59	57	290	18			
R24	Lost River Highway District	Trail Creek Road Rehabilitation, Custer County	\$2,006,000.00	STC-6868□	60	56	60	59	55	290	19			
R19	Madison County	South Salem Highway	\$2,045,000.00	STC-6770□	57	59	58	59	55	288	20			
R20	Jefferson County	Yellowstone Highway and 4000 E Turning Lanes	\$602,000.00	Minor collector□ SMA-8002 STC-2816	57	58	56	57	55	283	21			
R7	Blaine County	Buttercup Road Improvements	\$1,780,000.00	STC-2816	58	56	54	56	56	280	22			
R23	Oakley Highway District	Golden Valley Road (1000S) Rehabilitation; 950W to 800W	\$1,999,000.00	STC-2742□	64	62	66	65	11	268	23	Error in Rater #5 score		
R9	Custer County	Garden Creek Road, Phase 2	\$2,572,000.00	STC-6867□	55	53	52	54	53	267	24			
R1	City of Driggs	LeGrand Pierre Road Improvement	\$1,419,000.00	Minor Collector	55	52	55	53	49	264	25			
R8	North Latah County Highway District	Robinson Park Rd Improvements	\$1,950,000.00	SMA-7724□ STC-4751 & Minor collector	40	41	41	45	41	208	26			
R15	City of Culdesac	Main Street Improvements	\$1,485,000.00	STC-4751 & Minor collector	37	37	36	40	34	184	27			
R5	City of Challis	Main Street West Road Improvements	\$14,304,000.00	STC-6867□	36	34	37	40	36	183	28	Error in project cost		
Total			\$ 68,517,976.78											
Rural applications rating as presented Thursday March 7, 2019.														

2019 Rural Applications with Corrections to be presented 3-13-19

Ref. No.	Local Sponsor	Project Title	Total Cost	Construction Cost	Route	Scorer #1	Scorer #2	Scorer #3	Scorer #4	Scorer #5	Total Score					
R22	Raft River Highway District	Old Highway 81 S Road Rehabilitation, Stage 2	\$2,043,000.00	\$1,783,000.00	STC-2847□	67	68	68	67	65	335	1				
R10	Post Falls Highway District	Hayden Ave & Meyer Rd Intersection Improvements	\$1,908,000.00	\$1,520,000.00	STC-5734 STC-5791	65	67	65	66	66	329	2				
R13	Mountain Home Highway District	STC-3811, Pine-Featherville Road Rehabilitation Project	\$2,004,000.00	\$1,749,000.00	STC-3811□	67	63	65	65	62	322	4				
R2	Wendell Highway District	Bob Barton; 2200E-2400E	\$2,819,998.00	\$1,999,998.00	STC-2765□	67	61	66	65	63	322	3				
R23	Oakley Highway District	Golden Valley Road (1000S) Rehabilitation; 950W to 800W	\$1,999,000.00	\$1,744,000.00	STC-2742□	64	62	66	65	63	320	23	Revised 11 to total score of 63			
R26	Filer Highway District	3700 N Road; 2100 E to 2300 E	\$2,378,000.00	\$1,999,000.00	STC-2713□	65	63	63	64	63	318	5				
R17	Glenns Ferry Highway District	Old Highway 30; Hammett to Billy Rio Loop Rd STC-3816	\$2,000,000.00	\$1,681,000.00	STC-3816□	62	62	62	65	65	316	6				
R21	Murtaugh Highway District	1500W Road Rehabilitation Project; 1000S to 800S	\$2,008,000.00	\$1,753,000.00	STC-2742□	62	65	64	63	62	316	7				
R25	Hillsdale Highway District	Crestview Road Rehabilitation Phase II	\$2,423,000.00	\$2,037,000.00	STC-2793□	66	61	63	64	61	315	8				
R18	Oneida County	Old Highway 37, Phase III	\$2,000,000.00	\$1,681,000.00	STC-1701□	65	61	59	64	64	313	9				
R12	Worley Highway District	Rockford Bay Road, Ph 1 Improvements	\$2,001,987.94	\$1,645,366.00	STC-5749□	62	64	62	62	58	308	10				
R14	Bonner County	Garfield Bay Rd Reconstruction	\$1,097,037.00	\$922,350.00	STC-5774□	62	61	63	62	60	308	11				
R3	Burley Highway District	Yale Road Stage 5	\$2,306,000.00	\$1,884,000.00	STC-2837□	62	60	62	61	62	307	12				
R28	Hagerman Highway District	Hagerman Highway; 1200 E to 1400 E	\$2,374,000.00	\$1,996,000.00	STC-2775□	62	60	61	62	60	305	14				
R6	City of McCall	E Deinhard Lane Improvement Project	\$1,624,000.00	\$1,303,000.00	STC-3907□	63	59	60	63	59	304	15				
R27	West Point Highway District	1500 E Road; 3200 S to 3400 S	\$2,378,000.00	\$1,999,000.00	STC-2711□	62	60	59	61	60	302	16				
R16	Notus Parma Highway District #2	Galloway Road; Stafford to I-84	\$1,571,000.00	\$1,303,000.00	STC-3780□	60	57	59	59	57	292	17				
R24	Lost River Highway District	Trail Creek Road Rehabilitation, Custer County	\$2,006,000.00	\$1,751,000.00	STC-6868□	60	56	60	59	55	290	19				
R4	Teton County	S5000W Reconstruction	\$1,999,000.00	\$1,681,000.00	STC-6820□	59	56	59	59	57	290	18				
R19	Madison County	South Salem Highway	\$2,045,000.00	\$1,719,000.00	STC-6770□	57	59	58	59	55	288	20				
R11	East Side Highway District	E Sunnyside Road Improvements	\$3,420,953.84	\$2,876,216.00	STC-5746	61	63	61	62	59	286	13	1x4=4 pts x 5 raters=20 pts deduct			
R20	Jefferson County	Yellowstone Highway and 4000 E Turning Lanes	\$602,000.00	\$506,000.00	Minor collector□	57	58	56	57	55	283	21				
R7	Blaine County	Buttercup Road Improvements	\$1,780,000.00	\$1,594,164.00	SMA-8002 STC-2816	58	56	54	56	56	280	22				
R9	Custer County	Garden Creek Road, Phase 2	\$2,572,000.00	\$1,994,000.00	STC-6867□	55	53	52	54	53	267	24				
R1	City of Driggs	LeGrand Pierre Road Improvement	\$1,419,000.00	\$1,271,000.00	Minor Collector	55	52	55	53	49	264	25				
R8	North Latah County Highway District	Robinson Park Rd Improvements	\$1,950,000.00	\$1,702,000.00	SMA-7724□	40	41	41	45	41	208	26				
R15	City of Culesac	Main Street Improvements	\$1,485,000.00	\$1,314,000.00	STC-4751 & Minor collector	37	37	36	40	34	184	27				
R5	City of Challis	Main Street West Road Improvements	\$1,788,000.00	\$1,289,000.00	STC-6867□	36	34	37	40	36	183	28	Corrected project cost			
		Total	\$56,001,976.78	\$46,697,094.00												
		Rural applications rating as corrected Wednesday March 13, 2019.														

2019 Rural Applications To Post after Approval

Ref. No.	Local Sponsor	Project Title	Total Project Cost	Construction Cost	Route	Total Score	
R22	Raft River Highway District	Old Highway 81 S Road Rehabilitation, Stage 2	\$2,043,000.00	\$1,783,000.00	STC-2847	335	1
R10	Post Falls Highway District	Hayden Ave & Meyer Rd Intersection Improvements	\$1,908,000.00	\$1,520,000.00	STC-5734 STC-5791	329	2
R13	Mountain Home Highway District	STC-3811, Pine-Featherville Road Rehabilitation Project	\$2,004,000.00	\$1,749,000.00	STC-3811	322	3
R2	Wendell Highway District	Bob Barton; 2200E-2400E	\$2,819,998.00	\$1,999,998.00	STC-2765	322	4
R23	Oakley Highway District	Golden Valley Road (1000S) Rehabilitation; 950W to 800W	\$1,999,000.00	\$1,744,000.00	STC-2742	320	5
R26	Filer Highway District	3700 N Road; 2100 E to 2300 E	\$2,378,000.00	\$1,999,000.00	STC-2713	318	6
R17	Glenns Ferry Highway District	Old Highway 30; Hammett to Billy Rio Loop Rd STC-3816	\$2,000,000.00	\$1,681,000.00	STC-3816	316	7
R21	Murtaugh Highway District	1500W Road Rehabilitation Project; 1000S to 800S	\$2,008,000.00	\$1,753,000.00	STC-2742	316	8
R25	Hillsdale Highway District	Crestview Road Rehabilitation Phase II	\$2,423,000.00	\$2,037,000.00	STC-2793	315	9
R18	Oneida County	Old Highway 37, Phase III	\$2,000,000.00	\$1,681,000.00	STC-1701	313	10
R12	Worley Highway District	Rockford Bay Road, Ph 1 Improvements	\$2,001,987.94	\$1,645,366.00	STC-5749	308	11
R14	Bonner County	Garfield Bay Rd Reconstruction	\$1,097,037.00	\$922,350.00	STC-5774	308	12
R3	Burley Highway District	Yale Road Stage 5	\$2,306,000.00	\$1,884,000.00	STC-2837	307	13
R28	Hagerman Highway District	Hagerman Highway; 1200 E to 1400 E	\$2,374,000.00	\$1,996,000.00	STC-2775	305	14
R6	City of McCall	E Deinhard Lane Improvement Project	\$1,624,000.00	\$1,303,000.00	STC-3907	304	15
R27	West Point Highway District	1500 E Road; 3200 S to 3400 S	\$2,378,000.00	\$1,999,000.00	STC-2711	302	16
R16	Notus Parma Highway District #2	Galloway Road; Stafford to I-84	\$1,571,000.00	\$1,303,000.00	STC-3780	292	17
R24	Lost River Highway District	Trail Creek Road Rehabilitation, Custer County	\$2,006,000.00	\$1,751,000.00	STC-6868	290	18
R4	Teton County	S5000W Reconstruction	\$1,999,000.00	\$1,681,000.00	STC-6820	290	19
R19	Madison County	South Salem Highway	\$2,045,000.00	\$1,719,000.00	STC-6770	288	20
R11	East Side Highway District	E Sunnyside Road Improvements	\$3,420,953.84	\$2,876,216.00	STC-5746	286	21
R20	Jefferson County	Yellowstone Highway and 4000 E Turning Lanes	\$602,000.00	\$506,000.00	Minor Collector	283	22
R7	Blaine County	Buttercup Road Improvements	\$1,780,000.00	\$1,594,164.00	SMA-8002 STC-2816	280	23
R9	Custer County	Garden Creek Road, Phase 2	\$2,572,000.00	\$1,994,000.00	STC-6867	267	24
R1	City of Driggs	LeGrand Pierre Road Improvement	\$1,419,000.00	\$1,271,000.00	Minor Collector	264	25
R8	North Latah County Highway District	Robinson Park Rd Improvements	\$1,950,000.00	\$1,702,000.00	SMA-7724	208	26
R15	City of Culdesac	Main Street Improvements	\$1,485,000.00	\$1,314,000.00	STC-4751 & Minor Collector	184	27
R5	City of Challis	Main Street West Road Improvements	\$1,788,000.00	\$1,289,000.00	STC-6867	183	28
Total			\$56,001,976.78	\$46,697,094.00			